Christian Values and Implication to Community Development as Reflected by Juvenile Delinquency Rate at Benguet State University-Elementary Laboratory School in La Trinidad, Benguet, Philippines

Li, Jia

School of Music, Shaanxi Normal University, Shaanxi, 041004, CHINA

*Corresponding author email: lijia@sxnu.edu.cn

Available online 27 October 2021

Abstract: This study aims to determine the association of Christian Values Education to child development and how it contributes to school community development at Benguet State University Elementary Laboratory School. Specifically, the study sought to determine the relationship between the manifestation of Christian values and child development and the implication of Christian values education to school community development. The study utilized the descriptive correlation design. The study was done at the Benguet State University Elementary Laboratory School and BSU Guidance Office in La Trinidad, Benguet, Philippines. Most of the identified Christian values have generally affected the pupils' five domains of holistic development because the school teachers have religiously inculcated values into their teachings and daily disciplines in the school. However, the physical was less affected by the values of repentance, obedience, and responsibility. Likewise, cognitive domains of development were less affected by hope, trustworthiness and responsibility, which can be attributed to the rightful values that the teaching at the school was able to instil in the pupils with the sound jurisdiction of good and bad behaviours. Christian values education and holistic child development contribute to minimizing the juvenile delinquency rate, which leads to community development because a community with a very low delinquency rate implies a good community.

Keywords: Value, juvenile delinquency, community

1. Introduction

Values education is the aspect of educational practice in which moral or political values, norms, dispositions, and skills grounded in those values, are mediated to or learned by students (Thornberg & Oguz, 2016). Education is an organized effort towards learning basic facts about humanity. The core idea behind Christian Values is to cultivate essential values in the pupils so that the civilization that teaches us to manage complexities can be sustained and further developed. It begins at home, and it is continued in schools. Everyone accepts certain things through various mediums like society or government.

The various fields of human thought and behaviours are all involved in this search for values that give meaning to human adventure in the changing conditions of society in which man finds himself (Fang & Hoon, 2012). Among these various fields of human endeavour, education stands out as one of those fertile grounds for the realization of values in the individual as well as in society. Education is viewed as an exciting project of values in need of realization.

This study aims to correlate Christian Values and child development. Furthermore, it seeks to gauge how such correlation (if it exists) contributes to the development of the school community. The research problems are postulated as follows: 1) what is the relationship between Christian values and child development? 2) what is the implication of Christian values to community development?

The general objectives of this study are to determine the association of Christian values with child development and how it contributes to school community development at Benguet State University Elementary Laboratory School. Specifically, the study sought the following: a) to determine the relationship between the manifestation of Christian
values and child development; and 2) to determine the implication of Christian values to the school community development.

The following null hypotheses were tested, there is no significant relationship between Christian values manifestation and child development. The research framework is shown in Fig 1.

![Fig. 1: Conceptual framework](image)

2. Literature Review

Foreign literature strongly emphasizes the correlation between values and the development of an individual as a whole. And that a pupil's high achievement is connected to how values are inculcated in his development through processes culled from experiences in the home and school environment (Agus & Samuri, 2018).

The present study compares similarly with the foreign literature and studies review in that, at its core, it places the same premium on values education. However, it goes far to validate its correlation with the child development of children, which the researcher postulates to correlate with and prove a significant correlation between both concepts.

The local literature review focused on the values framework implemented in the public schools as mandated by the Philippine Government's constitution. It discussed the rationale behind teaching values in the country's public schools and the philosophy behind it. More importantly, it anchors itself in the historical and cultural context of the Filipino culture, thus exonerating the Filipino as a human being in society and his role in shaping society and the environment (Noda, 2018). It also discussed that the concepts of the Montessori Educational System espoused child development.

The present study compares similarly with those included in the local literature review in that it focuses on topics that were explored in such literature and studies, especially as regards values and child development in the Philippines, but differs comparatively since the list of studies reviewed, no research correlated values to child development and thus the present study can be a precedent to this especially as its setting is in a rural area of the Philippines.

3. Methodology

The present study utilized the descriptive correlation design. This method was used to first describe the Christian value formation and levels of child development of pupils and then establish the relationship of Christian values to the child development of pupils. A descriptive method was applied in depicting the implication of these values to community development.

The study was conducted at the Benguet State University Elementary Laboratory School and BSU Guidance Office in La Trinidad, Benguet, Philippines. Benguet State University is a 90-year-old school in the heart of La Trinidad, Benguet, the strawberry capital of the Philippines. Its history dates back to when the Baguio-La Trinidad road was only a rough horse trail in 1916. That was the year when the La Trinidad Experiment Station of the Bureau of Agriculture was turned over to the Bureau of Education. The La Trinidad Farm School was opened with 30 pupils in Grade V by this turn of events.

Data gathering started immediately after the corresponding school administrators approved the letters of permission to conduct the study. The researcher floated the survey questionnaires assisted by the school staff. Data gathering was coordinated with the school's faculty to facilitate the questionnaire's accomplishment by target pupils. Subsequently, the researcher retrieved the questionnaires, checked and verified the answers, and then processed the data.

Secondary data was collected from the guidance/student affairs office of Benguet State University, with duly permission from the department director, regarding the juvenile delinquency rates of the grade six pupils in the past five
years. Corresponding staff checked all the records before providing the data as above-mentioned.

4. Results
This section discusses the study's findings on the perceived correlation between Christian values and holistic child development. Furthermore, the community development data regarding juvenile delinquency is also explored and analyzed in pursuit of the implication between these Christian values and community development.

4.1 Relationship Between Christian Values and Holistic Child Development
Table 1 shows the correlation between the ten (10) Christian values evaluated in the study and the five (5) holistic child development domains. The computed R-values were then set against the p-value at the one (1) significance level to determine the relationship of each variable to the other.

The result indicates that the Christian value of repentance is significantly related to holistic child development domains social (0.52), cognitive (0.52), emotional (0.53), and Spiritual (0.81) development. The manifestation of this value across these developmental domains could be attributed to the pupils' sense of owning up to their mistakes. Although this is more pronounced in the social, emotional and spiritual contexts, pupils whose cognitive skills are keen also can manifest this value in their lives.

Reconciliation is significantly related to physical (0.87), social (0.57), cognitive (0.67), emotional (0.67), and spiritual (0.87) development. This Christian value is a product of the previous value, repentance. One will also manifest the move to reconcile as one perceives the wrong. As with the reasons explained in repentance, reconciliation is manifested more in social, emotional and spiritual development domains, but through keen cognitive skills; this Christian value becomes more pronounced in pupils with cognitive abilities (Zakaria et al., 2020).

Stewardship is significantly related to physical (0.86), social (0.61), cognitive (0.53), and spiritual (0.81) development. Stewardship is the Christian value that gives one a sense of responsibility to become the custodian of God's gifts to man. In a Christian context, pupils are taught that stewardship of God's resources may mean many things; hence, physical wellbeing is important; at the same time, relationships which can be viewed in the social context are also important, as well as cognitive skills that the pupils have, stewardship may mean the pupils are trying their best to hone their skills as a tribute to God. At the same time, the essence of stewardship is also manifested in one's communication with God; hence, it is also correlated with spiritual development.

Faith is significantly related to physical (0.85), social (0.80), cognitive (0.52), emotional (0.86), and spiritual (0.52) development. Faith is a Christian value that allows for a personal resignation to the will of God. This is a value engrained upon pupils early on in their schooling in a Christian school. Thus, faith is something that they live with and is manifested by the fact that they live out this value in their lives; hence all developmental domains correlate with this value.

Worship of God is significantly related to social (0.53), cognitive (0.81), emotional (0.53), and spiritual (0.81) development. Worshipping God is a fundamental Christian value that pupils in a Christian school are also taught early on; this Christian value precedes faith since as one has a personal relationship with God through worship, the value of having faith follows. The correlation of the different developmental domains can be attributed to them also exhibiting this worship in their lives such that they praise God, enriching their social and emotional relations, spiritual communion with God and honing their cognitive skills as a tribute to God.

Perseverance is significantly related to physical (0.53), social (0.81), cognitive (0.56), and spiritual (0.81) development. This Christian value is a product of a deep sense of faith, and its manifestation can be easily attributed to the pupils having a high degree of faith, which the study correlates with the pupil's perseverance in taking care of their physical well-being, social lives and in their honing the cognitive abilities as well. The spiritual life is also enriched by
this Christian value in that they grow more and more spiritually as their faith provides for them. Obedience is significantly related to social (0.83), cognitive (0.52), cognitive (0.62), and spiritual (0.83) development. This Christian value's correlation to the five holistic child development domains can also be attributed to their strong reliance on faith, thus making them obedient to what is needed for social, emotional, cognitive and spiritual well-being. As young pupils in a Christian school, obedience is very much taught to them, impressing into them this Christian value that warrants their commitment to doing things that are right and just; hence, their development in the five areas is a manifestation of this.

Hope is significantly related to physical (0.62), social (0.54), and emotional (0.64) development. The Christian value of hope is a value that is lived and manifested inwardly by a pupil but manifested outwardly through faith, obedience and responsibility. The reason this Christian value correlates with the give development domains could be attributed again to the fact that the pupil's relationship with God through worship increases their faith and, at the same time, increases their hope, which is then manifested in all aspects of life such as physical wellbeing, relationships in the social-emotional context of their personal lives. Trustworthiness is significantly related to physical (0.56), social (0.81), emotional (0.81), and spiritual (0.53) development. This Christian value manifests the true inculcation of good stewardship, obedience and responsibility. Trustworthiness is a product of the ability to impress upon oneself and other people the value that when trust is given, it places a higher value on the person. Thus, this value correlates well in the social-emotional, spiritual, and physical contexts since they manifested being able to be trusted to take care of themselves.

Responsibility is significantly related to social (0.87), emotional (0.52), and spiritual (0.83) development. This Christian value is where trustworthiness is spurred because as one accepts one's responsibility, the Christian value of that person's trustworthiness increases as well. A higher sense of responsibility of a pupil enables her to be responsible personally for her welfare. It is manifested in her actions in the school and home environment where her relationships are formed, giving more essence to her social and emotional relationships, the drive in her learning abilities and most especially, her relationship with God.

Christian values manifest themselves concretely when implemented as part of the general process of human knowledge and education. Christian Values cannot be separated from the human way of manifesting amongst human communities. Holistic child development has been anchored on the concept of holism, which looks at the child from every angle, looking at the development of a child as something as a whole rather than in separate parts about one's physical, social, cognitive, emotional and spiritual wellbeing (Anaraki et al., 2016). The basic approaches to holistic development are partly anchored on inculcation, moral development, analysis, values clarification and action learning. It goes further to say that the holistic ideology values the whole child and endeavours to understand the young child as an individual within their family, community and culture.

The results here clearly indicate that holism does not separate care and education to provide the best possible early years provision for the developing child. Thus, the kind of education one has been exposed to correlates with holistic growth and development.

Christian values affect the development of the child. The results underscore Lovat's (2007) paper 'What are values all about?' when he said values go to the heart of where education began, as a public good designed to make a difference, either as a supplement to what was offered at home or to make up for what was missing at home.' He placed the correlation of inculcating values to the various developmental aspects of a child aside from the basics of literacy and numeracy. The result is supported by what Lovat (2007) concludes that points to a positive correlation between values and the wellbeing or development of a pupil.

Comparatively, Schroeder et al. (2019) indicated that values such as honesty, respect, care, responsibility, and respecting the rights of others should be systematically taught to young children to form their character. The study recommends a more active role in teaching moral values since most institutions fail to meet their responsibilities to uphold the moral fibre of their pupils.

The present study fares similarly with that of Bautista et al. (2016), although the present study is more detailed, encompassing a range of correlations between specific values and holistic child development domains and where the results can specify the significant relationships to each other.

The results reveal here that although pupils practised these Christian values, manifestations of these in the different holistic child development domains remain significantly different, which can be attributed to each pupil's innate development being different from those of their classmates. Again, as stated in the literature each aspect of development is not only correlated by the Christian values inculcated in the pupils, but to a great extent because of other factors in the family, home, and social environment.

For Brown et al. (2006), whose results collaborate with what is noted here in this present study, the approaches to Values taken by a selection of schools in the Philippines determine how schools present values and their greater association with the development of each pupil in the school environment. To this, teachers are the best facilitators of this acquisition process of values that will benefit pupils and allow them to develop holistically. They discussed the challenges to values as the 'cognitive core' in transcending the formation of pupils that will allow them to manifest the Christian values in the home or school environment and provide their enhanced well-being.
Lovat and Toomey (2009) postulate that values and quality teaching are cohering. Values without quality teaching is an oxymoron, but quality teaching without values can suffer from the missing link that promises to strengthen and complete it. The study compares to this in that the presented results underscore the importance of teachers as facilitators of learning Christian values and can validate its manifestation in the school environment. It compares similarly with his paper (Lovat, 2007), which places a premium on values to holistically develop a child. Understandably, pupils in this non-sectarian school did not receive formal Christian values because of the nature of the curricula in their educational institution, which impacts the results. Pupils subject to values without quality teaching have the potential to suffer from the missing link that promises to strengthen and complete it. Therefore, teachers have the primary role of teaching values to pupils and providing the missing link that would connect it to their development through effective facilitation of the learning process. It also correlates with Martinek and Hellison (2016) as they postulate that educating children to take personal responsibility for their actions is a societal responsibility. They averred that schools can teach values that help sustain pupil's development. Poor development can be traced to institutions failing to meet the teaching of moral values for children to meet their responsibilities in real life.

4.2 Effects of Christian Values Education on the Juvenile Delinquency Rate in School

Juvenile delinquency, also known as juvenile offending or youth crime, is participation in illegal behaviour by minors (juveniles) (individuals younger than the statutory age of majority). The juvenile delinquency rate has been widely established as an indicator of community development, such as by the Central Ohio Community Development Research Center and the San Angelo Social Health Index Project.

There are many schools of thought as to the primary factors that contribute to juvenile delinquency. Many of these are tied to nature/nurture arguments. It is certainly the case that children who are neglected, abused or impoverished are statistically more likely to fall into delinquency patterns. Though this may be statistically relevant, it fails to account for the delinquency of those with suitable living circumstances. Geneticists frequently refute the idea that children are a tabula rasa, or blank slate (Wright & Wright, 1993).

4.3 Physical Violence

The result shows that in the past five (5) years, the physical violence rate has been kept at zero, which indicates a non-violent community at the BSU-ELS. The zero rate of physical violence proved the suggestion that the values were able to reinforce the critical control of the pupils in the worldview formation by teaching pupils to tolerate the negative incidences against them and forgive (Krug et al., 2002). This can be attributed to the repentance values that the pupils have in pursuit of spiritual development (Katerndahl et al., 2015), which leads to a non-violent community. The same goes for faith in God's word and the sense of stewardship in maintaining a good interpersonal relation among peer groups by avoiding physically violent actions (Krug et al., 2002). School violence is the intentional use of physical force or power, threatened or actual, against another person or against a group or community that results in or has a high likelihood of resulting in injury, death, psychological harm, maldevelopment, or deprivation”. The result indicates that research and programs addressing physical violence typically include persons between the ages of seven (7) and 24, although patterns of violence can begin in early childhood. Each aspect is important to understanding the causes of violence and designing prevention programs. School administrators expect schools to be safe havens of learning. Violence can disrupt learning and hurt pupils, the school, and the broader community.

4.4 Verbal Abuse

Verbal abuse cases reported to the guidance office of the Benguet State University show rather low rates, which have been maintaining zero occurrences in the past five years. This study indicates that the school community is highly disciplined and secure.

The low rate of verbal abuse indicates that Christian values were installed into the pupil's belief system, especially in belief towards the gospel sacrament. This result complies with the statement that values best describe the essential interior disposition required for this sacrament. The result shows that reconciliation wipes out the eternal punishment, which is the inevitable consequence of mortal sin, as against verbal abuse. Christian values is a spiritual medicine which strengthens as well as heals. That is why the pupil's intent on leading a good life will make it a practice to receive God's words by avoiding verbal misbehaviour. According to Christian teachings, this is due to the belief that avoidance of verbal abuse is one of the best guarantees against falling into grave sin.

Verbal abuse (also known as reviling) is described as a negative defining statement told to the person or about the person or by withholding any response thus defining the target as non-existent. If the abuser doesn't immediately apologize and indulge in a defining statement, the relationship may be a verbally abusive one. The result supports that in schools, a young person may indulge in verbal abuse — bullying (which often has a physical component) to gain status as superior to the person targeted and to bond with others against the target (Tomollyus et al., 2016). Generally, the bully knows no other way to connect emotionally, i.e., be bonded with others. Verbal abuse includes the following: countering, withholding, discounting, abuse disguised as a joke, blocking and diverting, accusing and blaming, judging and criticizing, trivializing, undermining, threatening, name-calling, chronic forgetting, ordering, denial of anger or
abuse, and abusive anger.

Sexually Related Misbehavior. The sexually related misbehaviour cases reported to the guidance office of the Benguet State University show rather low rates, which have been maintaining zero occurrences in the past five years. This indicates a rather spiritually healthier school community. It can be attributed to the reason that the BSU elementary program serves as a treatment program for adolescent males who have behaved in sexually offensive ways and who have been determined to need residential care. These adolescents are best served by intensive, long-term, supervised pastoral care offered by the staff members with specific treatment for their sexual and related misbehaviour by instilling the words and doctrines of Christianity. The result shows that the values are in pupils' minds as the persuasion of the mind that a certain statement of the certain authority is true, especially from God. In other words, it speaks of the pupil's capacity to control their burgeoning sexual motivations. It admits of many degrees up to full assurance of faith by the evidence on which it rests. To the pupils, this low rate results from the teaching of values. Knowledge is an essential element in all control against sexual curiosity. More especially to the pupils is the broad scope of the spiritual life whereby one sees faith not as something one has but as something in a relationship. It involves an awareness of and an attunement to God's presence in one's everyday experiences (Weitz et al., 2012). The results support that practise values and avoiding sexual misbehaviour by the pupils are like developing any relationship with God.

Academic Cheating Misbehavior. The academic cheating misbehaviour cases reported to the guidance office of Benguet State University show rather low rates, which have been maintained at zero occurrences in the past five years. This indicates an academically disciplined and honest school community (Farnese et al., 2011). Academic dishonesty often arises from the fact that the pupils do not know what is right and wrong. The right strategy to fight against such acts in the school is to prevent them by installing a good doctrine of goodness rather than punishment. The BSU elementary program serves well for this purpose. Value is a learned Virtue. It is learned through trust in what people obey. In this case, the children obey the school discipline in academic development. Christian values always teach them the obedience of the academic discipline as expected of pupils. This is one of the four cardinal virtues subordinate to the theological virtues of Faith, Hope, and Charity. The result indicates that academic integrity among the pupils shows their faith in obeying God's Faith of redemption against sinfulness.

Theft Misbehavior. Theft misbehaviour cases reported to the Benguet State University guidance office show rather low rates, maintaining zero occurrences in the past five years. This shows that the school community is highly secure and honest. The result shows that the BSU pupils believe those most likely to take responsibility tend to be honest, reliable, and worthy of our trust. They all recognize the benefits of being honest with their friends and loved ones, their family, and their lives. The pupils show honesty with themselves; they know when they are not living up to their responsibilities. The burdens of keeping moral integrity are always made easier with the help of honesty and courage (Mwaniki, 2018). The result supports the extrapolation that personal responsibility is an obligation to oneself. It is one's duty to ensure good character and behaviour irrespective of how one was brought up and what kind of conditioning one has received. Individual responsibility also includes being accountable for the degree and level of one's health, wealth, success and happiness. Such honesty in the pupils' spiritual development denotes the implication of Christian values in keeping the worldview maturation of the BSU pupils on the right track by discriminating against theft behaviour as sinfulness to Christians.

"Theft" includes attempted and completed purse-snatching, completed pickpocketing, and all attempted and completed thefts, excluding motor vehicle theft. "At school" includes the school building, on school property, and a bus going to and from school.

BSU's elementary program can serve as a good means of indoctrinate the pupils with the right judgments against theft, which is non-biblical. This enhanced community behaviour pattern can be observed in theft.

In summary, the community development investigation's result supports the study by Ahmad and Talib (2015). Kintu et al. (2017) established a strong correlation between values and school community development by exploring the postulate that educating children to take personal responsibility for their actions is both a community and a societal responsibility. They averred that schools can teach values that help sustain us as a nation: respect for all people, reverence for the sanctity of life, the right of dissent and equality for all people before the law.

The result can be further extended to propose the antithesis that poor behaviour and immoral character can be traced to institutions failing to meet the teaching of moral values for children to meet their responsibilities in real life. And all these contribute to the school community in general. As observed from the pupils' behaviours and developmental domains as shown above, the consistency between the high achievement of both aspects established a solid postulation that the values from the classroom enculturation help the pupils to establish good criteria in their daily life, which contributes to a low juvenile delinquency rate and a rather highly disciplined school community and social community in general. The values contribute to the holistic development of children, which further motivates community development in a positive way.

Christian values provide the pupils with a fundamental change of thought to rebuild their worldview of goodness and badness, rightness and wrongness. In religious contexts, it usually refers to confession to God, ceasing sin against God, and resolving to live according to religious law. It typically includes an admission of guilt, a promise or resolve not to repeat the offence, an attempt to make restitution for the wrong, or, in some way, to reverse the harmful effects of
the wrong where possible. These doctrines have been bluntly reflected in the community of BSU Elementary School. The zero rates on all juvenile delinquency parameters indicate that the Christian values installed in the belief system of BSU Elementary Laboratory School have contributed greatly to the holistic development of the children and served the purpose of community building and development in the long run.

5. Discussion

The implications of Christian values to the school community in terms of juvenile delinquency rate is the study assessed the relationships between the Christian values and holistic child development of the pupils, and it also looked into the effects of the Christian values of the pupils on the community development in terms of juvenile delinquency rate in the school. The salient findings of the study are the following: 1) the social aspect of holistic child development was significantly affected by the Christian values of repentance, reconciliation, stewardship, faith, worship of God, perseverance, obedience, hope, trustworthiness and responsibility. The identified Christian values significantly affected the spiritual aspects of development, except for the value of Hope. The Emotional aspect was affected by almost all the identified values except for stewardship and perseverance. The identified values significantly affected the cognitive, except for stewardship and perseverance. Similarly, the physical domain was significantly affected by the identified values except for repentance, Worship of God, obedience and responsibility; and 2) the manifested Christian values and child development had positively affected community development as shown by the zero or low incidence of delinquency rate in terms of grave physical violence, verbal abuse, sexually related misbehaviour, academic cheating and theft in the school campus.

The study of values and their relationship to holistic development ultimately correlates with the role of schools in the larger picture of the community as a whole. It focuses on the teacher's role to contribute toward pupils' character formation, which is reflective in part of their own, for the promotion of values so that every pupil may have a sense of responsibility which comes from a call to serve the wider community. The study reinforces that teaching values translate, to some degree, the importance of teachers becoming part of a "community of practice" that is involved in negotiating meaning and continuous understanding and re-understanding of values, thus playing an important role in building identity among pupils.

The study's implication on community development takes its thrust on the value of partnership for family involvement in education and the community. It has been established that values, though taught in the school environment, can only be fully inculcated among pupils with the community members or family of the pupil integrating these values into the home environment and the community.

Thus, the researcher supports the concept of promoting school, family, and community partnerships that make this three-fold approach produce the best outcomes for the value formation of pupils. Educators sometimes are content to let community members and families take the initiative in becoming involved in their children's education. But for a real partnership to occur, educators must look at ways the school can initiate this involvement (Bartolome et al., 2017). In such a partnership, the school and the home share responsibility for children's learning; the relationship is based on mutual respect and acknowledgement of the assets and expertise of each member. As an extension of this partnership, schools can emphasize a broad base of community involvement (Bartolome et al., 2020). When schools develop and implement strategies for promoting effective school-family-community partnerships, the result is improved learning for all pupils and strengthened schools, families, and communities.

In summary, the school community development of the study has been showing a healthier status in terms of zero juvenile delinquency rate, which indicates a healthier community environment.

6. Conclusion

Based on the study's results, the following conclusions were drawn: Most of the identified Christian values have generally affected the pupils' five domains of holistic development because the school teachers have religiously inculcated values into their teachings and daily disciplines. However, the physical was less affected by the values of repentance, obedience, and responsibility. Likewise, cognitive domains of development were less affected by hope, trustworthiness and responsibility because, which can be attributed to the rightful values that the teaching at the school was able to instil in the pupils with the sound jurisdiction of good and bad behaviours; and 2) Christian values education and holistic child development contribute in minimizing juvenile delinquency rate that leads to community development because a community with a very low delinquency rate implies a good community. Juvenile delinquency may be seen in terms of grave physical violence, verbal abuse, sexually related misbehaviour, academic cheating and theft.

Acknowledgement

The researcher would like to present his greatest appreciation to all the participants of this study.
References


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.01.002


